



Columbia County, New York  
**Planning Board**

**Meeting Minutes – 21 February 2012**

**Members Present**

Cheryl Gilbert  
Arthur Koweek, *Vice - Chair*  
Steve J. Savarese  
Larry Saulpaugh  
Timothy Stalker, *Chair*  
George Super

**Staff Present**

Patrice O. Perry, *Senior Planner*

**Guests**

Melanie Hunt

**Members absent – Notified**

John V. Florio, Jr.

**CALL TO ORDER and APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Chairman Timothy Stalker called the meeting to order at 6:30 PM. Chairman Stalker opened the floor to the CCPB for any changes to the 17 January 2012 meeting minutes. George Super motioned to approve. Cheryl Gilbert seconded. Vote: All in favor.

**NYS GENERAL MUNICIPAL LAW §239-l, §239-m REFERRALS**

1. **#12-003– Town of Livingston Planning Board**

Hudson Valley Creamery, Site Plan Review

The proposed action is the establishment of Eurial, a cheese re-pack operation. The proposed food processing use includes retrofitting an existing structure, located at 2986 US Route 9 in the Town of Livingston, NY.

**Recommendation: APPROVAL**

The CCPB finds that this proposed action, establishment of Hudson Valley Creamery, will likely result in significant county-wide and intercommunity impacts. The recommendation of Approval is based on the following considerations set forth in NYSGML Section 239 (l):

*(g) official municipal and county development policies, as may be expressed through comprehensive plans, capital programs or regulatory measures; and*

*(h) such other matters as may relate to the public convenience, to governmental efficiency, and to the achieving and maintaining of a satisfactory community environment.*

It is anticipated that the establishment of Hudson Valley Creamery, in the Town of Livingston will result in the creation of new permanent jobs in Columbia County, in addition to the construction jobs. The proposed cheese processing plant will be located on a site with existing structures, previously occupied by various food processing/manufacturing uses. The redevelopment of this site and structure will result in the expansion of the commercial tax base. The overall result will be a positive impact to the community of Livingston and the Columbia County economy as a whole.

The CCPB notes that currently curd is imported from abroad, but that part of the vision of the Hudson Valley Creamery is the use of goat milk from herds in the region as part of their ten year plan. This will positively impact agriculture in the Hudson Valley. The development of agribusiness in Columbia County is an industry which has been identified as an important component of the County and regional economy.

The Hudson Valley Creamery project supports the goals of the Columbia County development policies to attract new business. The CCPB finds that the economic impacts of this proposal will be positive. The CCPB

**Columbia County Planning Board, 21 February 2012 Meeting Minutes**

recommends Approval of this project provided all local, state, and federal regulations are complied with. The Town of Livingston Planning Board may take final action on this application with a simple majority vote.

Motion: Cheryl Gilbert Second: Steve Savarese

**Vote: #12-003**

REGION	MEMBER	AYE	NAY	ABST.	NOT PRESENT
1	Cheryl Gilbert	X			
2	Timothy Stalker	X			
3	OPEN				
4	John V. Florio, Jr.				X
5	Arthur Koweek	X			
6	Larry Saulpaugh	X			
7	OPEN				
8	Steve J. Savarese	X			
At Large	George Super	X			
	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>

**2. #12-004 – Town of New Lebanon Planning Board**

Blueberry Hill Market Café/Melanie Hunt, Site Plan Review

The proposed action is to establish a café and retail gourmet food market use in an existing structure located at 515 US Route 20 in the Town of New Lebanon, NY.

Recommendation: no apparent significant county wide or inter-community impact

Comments:

1. Access: The CCPB suggests that the applicant initiate contact with the New York State Department of Transportation (NYSDOT) regarding any improvements that may be necessary as a result of the proposed commercial use.
2. Food Service: The CCPB suggests that the applicant initiate contact with the Columbia County Department of Health (CCDOH) regarding any necessary reviews and approvals which may be required for the establishment of the restaurant use.
3. Septic: The CCPB suggests that the applicant initiate contact with the CCDOH regarding any necessary reviews and approvals which may be required for the septic system. In addition, the CCPB suggests that the applicant delineate the location of on-lot septic on the site plan.

Motion: Arthur Koweek Second: George Super

**Vote: #12-004**

REGION	MEMBER	AYE	NAY	ABST.	NOT PRESENT
1	Cheryl Gilbert	X			
2	Timothy Stalker	X			
3	OPEN				
4	John V. Florio, Jr.				X
5	Arthur Koweek	X			
6	Larry Saulpaugh	X			
7	OPEN				
8	Steve J. Savarese	X			
At Large	George Super	X			
	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>

**3. #12-005 – Town of Claverack Zoning Board of Appeals**

Foundation for Agricultural Integrity, Special Exception Permit

## Columbia County Planning Board, 21 February 2012 Meeting Minutes

The proposed action is to establish a dairy farm which will include the construction of a hoop barn, greenhouse, and farm store/farm stand. The site is partially located in the Towns of Claverack and Livingston, with frontage on both sides of Columbia County Route 12.

Recommendation: APPROVAL

The CCPB finds that this proposed action, the establishment of a dairy farm, will likely result in significant county-wide and intercommunity impacts. The recommendation of Approval is based on the following considerations set forth in NYSGML Section 239 (1):

*(g) official municipal and county development policies, as may be expressed through comprehensive plans, capital programs or regulatory measures; and*

*(h) such other matters as may relate to the public convenience, to governmental efficiency, and to the achieving and maintaining of a satisfactory community environment.*

The site of the proposed dairy farm straddles Columbia County Route 12, and is situate in two municipalities – Claverack and Livingston. It is also located within the New York State Department of Agriculture and Markets Certified, Columbia County Agricultural District #3.

In 1993 Columbia County Board of Supervisors adopted a Right to Farm Law, setting forth the importance of agriculture. Farming has historically been a major part of the County economy and continues to be an important industry segment. The Foundation for Agricultural Integrity project supports the goals of the Columbia County development policies towards agriculture. The development of new business in support of agricultural uses has been identified as a key area of economic development for the County. The CCPB finds that the economic impacts of this farming operation will be positive.

Columbia County is supportive of Agritourism and a farmer’s market is an enterprise which the Columbia County Tourism Department promotes. Farmer’s markets are an attraction for Columbia County visitors. The County has produced a map titled, Columbia County Farms and Farm Markets, which is “A map & guide to what’s good, fresh & local”. In addition, on the Tourism Department website, a listing of farmer’s markets may be found on the

"Shopping" page, under the “Country Markets” category,  
<http://www.columbiacountytourism.org/index.php/shopping/map/>.

The CCPB recommends Approval of this project provided all local, state, and federal regulations are complied with. The Town of Claverack Zoning Board of Appeals may take final action on this application with a simple majority vote.

Comments:

The following comment is offered for consideration:

1. Access: The CCPB suggests that the applicant initiate contact with Columbia County Highway Department regarding any necessary review and approvals for proposed access off Columbia County Route 12
2. Cheese Room: The CCPB notes that additional reviews and/or approvals may be necessary if any cheese processing is proposed to occur on site.

Motion: Timothy Stalker Second: Arthur Koweek

**Vote: #12-005**

REGION	MEMBER	AYE	NAY	ABST.	NOT PRESENT
1	Cheryl Gilbert	X			
2	Timothy Stalker	X			
3	OPEN				
4	John V. Florio, Jr.				X

## Columbia County Planning Board, 21 February 2012 Meeting Minutes

5	Arthur Koweek	X			
6	Larry Saulpaugh	X			
7	OPEN				
8	Steve J. Savarese	X			
At Large	George Super	X			
	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>

#### 4. **#12-006 – Village of Chatham Planning Board**

Chatham 2011 LLC/Hampshire Co., Site Plan Review

The proposed action is the expansion of Chatham Plaza, an existing commercial plaza located off Dardess Road, along NYS Route 66 in the Village of Chatham, NY.

Recommendation: MODIFICATION

The CCPB finds that this proposed action, the expansion of Chatham Plaza, an existing commercial plaza, will likely result in significant county-wide and intercommunity impacts. The recommendation of Modification is based on the following considerations set forth in NYSGML Section 239 (l):

*(g) official municipal and county development policies, as may be expressed through comprehensive plans, capital programs or regulatory measures; and*

*(h) such other matters as may relate to the public convenience, to governmental efficiency, and to the achieving and maintaining of a satisfactory community environment.*

1. Waste Water: The CCPB notes that the existing sewage treatment plant for the Village of Chatham is currently undergoing upgrades and expansion. A letter provided dated January 20, 2012, to Patrice Perry, Senior Planner Columbia County Planning/Economic Development from Douglas C. Clark, P.E., references a letter from New York State Department of Environmental Conservation (NYSDEC) related to this “I/I work”. A copy of this letter was requested, however was not received prior to the CCPB meeting on 21 February 2012. As a result, it is unclear if adequate capacity will exist for this facility. The CCPB also notes that NYSDEC approval is required for this expansion. The CCPB suggests that the applicant provide information on the status of this approval process.
2. Emergency Services: The CCPB suggests that the applicant initiate contact with the local Fire Chief for review and comment of the proposed site plan.
3. Connector Road: The CCPB encourages the applicant to take advantage of opportunities to provide a connector road to the south on the adjacent parcel and proposed location of Price Chopper supermarket development (Fairpoint property).
4. Stormwater: The CCPB notes that the Environmental Assessment Form (EAF) #25 denotes approvals are required from NYSDEC for Stormwater. The CCPB suggests that the applicant provide information on the status of that review and approval.
5. Environmental Assessment Form (EAF): The CCPB suggests that the EAF be reviewed for completeness:
  - The “attached narrative” noted on page 2 of 21 was not contained in the referral package.
  - Questions #18 and #19 on page 5 of 12 are not completed.
  - Question #12a on page 6 of 21 denotes “5,000 gpd sewage” while the previously referenced letter to P. Perry from D. Clark, includes information that the “Predicted Flow – Total Plaza after Expansion 6,000 gpd.” Clarification is necessary.
  - Question #25 on page 8 of 21 should include all necessary approvals required and the types. (e.g., Columbia County Department of Health, modification to SPDES permit for wastewater)

**Columbia County Planning Board, 21 February 2012 Meeting Minutes**

- 6. Columbia County Department of Health (CCDOH): The CCPB suggests that the applicant initiate contact with CCDOH regarding any necessary reviews and approvals that would be required for the expanded Price Chopper and relocation of LaGonia's restaurant.
- 7. Elevations: The CCPB notes that the submission is lacking elevations of the façades, which is a Village of Chatham Zoning requirement for site plan modifications which include alterations to the structures.

The CCPB therefore recommends Modification to the proposal.

Motion: Arthur Koweek    Second: Steve Savarese

**Vote: #12-006**

REGION	MEMBER	AYE	NAY	ABST.	NOT PRESENT
1	Cheryl Gilbert	X			
2	Timothy Stalker	X			
3	OPEN				
4	John V. Florio, Jr.				X
5	Arthur Koweek	X			
6	Larry Saulpaugh	X			
7	OPEN				
8	Steve J. Savarese	X			
At Large	George Super	X			
	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>

**5. #12-007 – Town of Canaan Zoning Board of Appeals**

Karuna Tendai Dharma Center – Special Use Permit

The proposed action is to convert an existing garage to an accessory dormitory. The dormitory is part of an existing Buddhist temple with teaching/training center located at 1525 NYS Route 295 in the Town of Canaan, NY.

Recommendation: no apparent significant county wide or inter-community impact

Comments:

- 1. Site Plan Review: The CCPB notes that Special Use Permits may also require Site Plan Review from the Canaan Planning Board.
- 2. NYS Fire Prevention and Building Code: The CCPB notes that the Canaan Planning Board has requested additional information related to compliance with NYS Fire Prevention and Building Code. This will not affect the CCPB recommendation providing that the structure is converted in compliance with applicable codes.

Motion: Cheryl Gilbert    Second: Larry Saulpaugh

**Vote: #12-007**

REGION	MEMBER	AYE	NAY	ABST.	NOT PRESENT
1	Cheryl Gilbert	X			
2	Timothy Stalker	X			
3	OPEN				
4	John V. Florio, Jr.				X
5	Arthur Koweek	X			
6	Larry Saulpaugh	X			
7	OPEN				
8	Steve J. Savarese	X			
At Large	George Super	X			
	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>

**EXEMPT ACTIONS** - proposed actions exempt from mandatory referral NYSGML §239-m.3. (c)

NA

## Columbia County Planning Board, 21 February 2012 Meeting Minutes

### 1. OLD BUSINESS MEMBER TERMS

Patrice Perry, Senior Planner sent memos to Supervisors regarding vacancies on the CCPB which resulted in nomination of John V. Florio, Jr. Region #4, Towns of Greenport and Stockport, and Alice Platt for Region #7 Towns of Gallatin and Taghkanic. These nominations will be presented at the County Government Committee Meeting on 2/22/12.

### NEW YORK PLANNING FEDERATION ANNUAL CONFERENCE

- Sunday April 15<sup>th</sup>, 2012 – Tues April 17<sup>th</sup>, 2012
- Location: Saratoga Hilton, Saratoga Springs, New York
- February 2012 CCPED Committee for approval
- Speaker for Plenary Session – Robert Freeman, Committee on Open Government
- Chairman Stalker noted the NYPF is seeking nominees for awards. Steve Savarese requested a nomination form for Heissenbuttel Award

Members interested in attending include: Arthur Koweek, Steve Savarese, Larry Saulpaugh, Cheryl Gilbert and Timothy Stalker.

### 2. NEW BUSINESS

1. **Committee:** Patrice Perry and Tim Stalker attended January County Government Committee meeting. Patrice gave brief overview of the CCPB, authority responsibilities and provided the CCPB 2011 Report. Tim Stalker also spoke on behalf of the CCPB noting in particular the challenges faced in 2010 and noted the letters of support the CCPB had issued.
2. **Training:** Chairman Stalker noted the upcoming NYSDOS training session with Greene County and asked members for idea/speakers for future sessions.
3. **Economic Development:** Arthur Koweek noted the new industry developing in Columbia County and congratulated Commissioner Ken Flood for his efforts to bring in new business into the County.

### ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Stalker adjourned the meeting at 7: 50PM. The next scheduled meeting is

***Tuesday 20 March 2012, 6:30 PM***

***1st Floor Committee Room, Columbia County Offices  
401 State Street, Hudson, NY***